EAU CLAIRE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting of October 10, 2013

Members Present: Katrinka Bourne, Ken Ziehr, Dave Strobel, Jim Seymour, Carrie

Ronnander, Karen Nusbaum, Patrick Kurtenbach

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Pat Ivory

Minutes. The minutes of the September 3, 2013 meeting were approved as

written.

The meeting was chaired by Katrinka Bourne and called to order at 4:30 p.m.

1. Public Hearing and Consideration of Designation of 6 South Barstow Street as a Locally Designated Property as Provided in Chapter 2.65. Pat Ivory provided an overview of the provisions of the Landmarks Ordinance (Chapter 2.65) for designating properties as local landmarks, the current zoning and General Development plan of the property, and the architecture and history of the building at 6 South Barstow Street. It was noted that the property was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1984 and included as part of the Confluence Commercial Historic District in 2007. The 1984 National Register nomination stated that the building was included on the National Register as a good local example of commercial neo-Gothic architecture. Pat also reviewed correspondence received regarding the proposed designation, including an email in opposition from Lois and Jerry Heymans indicating that they were the owners of the property.

Katrinka Bourne reviewed the mission statement of the Commission.

Dave Strobel provided background as to why he felt that the Commission should be considering 6 South Barstow Street as a local landmark property. He noted that the policies contained in the Comprehensive Plan and the Landmarks Ordinance states that the Commission should be working to preserve historic districts and properties such as this. He added that several of the downtown plans emphasized the importance of retaining the older buildings within the downtown area.

Jon Case spoke in support of the designation. Mr. Case stated that a number of significant older buildings in the downtown have been demolished over the years and it as important to preserve the remaining significant buildings. He stated that he felt that the building was in better condition than stated by project developer.

John Mann, a history professor at the University of Wisconsin – Eau Claire, spoke in support of the designation. Dr. Mann discussed the difference between old and historic buildings

Eau Claire Landmarks Commission Meeting of October 10, 2013 Page 2 of 4

noting that 6 South Barstow is listed on the National Register because of its historic architectural significance. He noted that since the building is on the National Register, that it certainly should be listed on the local historic registry. He stated that every property listed on the National Register should be included on the local register and he disagreed with previous Commission actions of not landmarking properties if the owner happened to object.

Sharon Hildebrand stated that she would like to see the Confluence Project proceed, but that it should incorporate the historic buildings. She stated that the Commission needed to become more proactive in their designations of National Register properties. She added that if the redevelopment project proceeds, that the Commission should be involved in reviewing the designs of the new buildings.

Linda McAllom spoke in support. Ms. McAllom stated that this building was the last Art Deco building left in Eau Claire and should be preserved.

Dawn Bergstrom spoke in support. Ms. Bergstom discussed the Scandinavian Imports business located to the south and the architectural importance of the building.

John Juldwin spoke in support. Mr. Juldwin stated that it is easy to tear down a building, but once it is gone, it cannot be replaced. He added that he felt that the building was in better condition than indicated by the developer.

Janice Newcowski, President of the Historic Preservation Foundation, spoke in support of the local designation.

Judy Olson spoke in support. Ms. Olson stated that her father was involved with the construction of the building. She added that the Commission should remain true to its purpose and that the uniqueness of buildings like this add to the draw of tourism to the downtown area.

Christine Webster spoke in support. Ms. Webster stated that she objected to the developers considering these older buildings as worthless, rather they should be incorporated into the Confluence Project. She stated that the City should honor the community's past, present, and future by saving the building.

Robert Gough spoke in support. Mr. Gough stated that he was on the State Review Board for historic buildings and speaking on his own behalf, stated that the building is important architecturally and should be incorporated into the developer's project rather than demolished. He added that he wouldn't always encourage designating a building against the objection of the owner, but in this case, it would be justified.

Eau Claire Landmarks Commission Meeting of October 10, 2013 Page 3 of 4

Angela Juldwin spoke in support. Ms. Juldwin stated that the Commission needed to honor its mission and purpose statements.

Tom Olson spoke in support. Mr. Olson stated that buildings such as 6 South Barstow Street are part of the community's heritage and are important to us.

Shirley Simikson spoke in support. Ms. Simikson indicated that buildings such as this are important to encourage tourism and promote a uniqueness of the downtown area.

Toston Umfia spoke in support. Mr. Umfia stated that he was visiting Eau Claire from Germany and was surprised that buildings such as this would be considered for demolition. He stated that the community importance of preserving buildings like this was greater than the individual's plans to demolish the building.

Steve Johnson spoke in support. Mr. Johnson stated that buildings such as this should be considered as works of art and preserved.

Mark Wanes spoke in support, stating that the Commission must approve the designation to be consistent with their goals and mission.

There were no additional comments from the public and Katrinka Bourne closed the public hearing.

ACTION TAKEN: Pat Kurtenbach moved to approve the designation of 6 South Barstow street as a local landmark property finding that under criteria #3 in 2.65.050, that the building is a good local example of Neo-gothic commercial architecture in that the building embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type, inherently valuable for the study of a particular period, style, method of construction or of indigenous materials or craftsmanship. Dave Strobel seconded the motion. The motion carried with Carrie Ronnander and Jim Seymour voting no.

2. Consideration of Submitting a Grant Application for CLG Funds. The Commission discussed the possibility of submitting an application for CLG Grant funds from the Wisconsin Historical Society (WHS). It was noted that the Commission intended to submit a grant application for the preparation of a National Register nomination for 322 Water Street, but the WHS had just informed the Commission that the property was not eligible. The Commission discussed other potential projects. A notice of intent to potentially submit an application for this funding had been submitted earlier in the fall.

ACTION TAKEN: Carrie Ronnander moved to not submit an application at this time. Ken Ziehr seconded the motion. All votes were in favor. Motion carried.

Eau Claire Landmarks Commission Meeting of October 10, 2013 Page 4 of 4

3. Update on Landmark Activities and Properties.

- A. Status of National Register Determination for 322 Water Street. The Commission discussed the recent rejection of 322 Water Street as being eligible for the National Register. The Commission expressed their disappointment in the determination made by the WHS and their narrow interpretation of the eligibility of the property.
- **B.** Report from Historic Preservation Foundation. Pat Kurtenbach updated the Commission on HPF activities including: preparation of a newsletter, the house hunt project, and upcoming membership drive.
- **C. City Hall South Entrance.** The Commission was informed that the construction work for the City Hall south entrance had been awarded. Work should commence within a couple weeks. The design for the entrance had been approved by the Commission and WHS.

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

Submitted by,

Patrick Kurtenbach, Secretary