

6/7/10 - Monday, June 7, 2010

**EAU CLAIRE
LANDMARKS COMMISSION**

Meeting of June 7, 2010

Members Present: Jenny Ebert, Katrinka Bourne, Barbara Lozar, Carrie Ronnander, Sue Nelson Ken Fulgione, David Klinkhammer

Members Absent: None

Minutes. The minutes of the May 3, 2010 meeting were approved as written.

The meeting was chaired by Jenny Ebert.

1. Consideration of Certificate of Appropriateness to reside 421 Hudson Street.

The Commission reviewed an application for Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Kathleen Johnston-Glasmyer to install vinyl siding to her house located at 421 Hudson Street. The property in question is listed as a contributing property within the Randall Park Historic Landmark District. Work on the project has started and has since stopped once the owner was informed that a building permit was required for the work.

Ms. Johnston-Glasmyer was present at the meeting and indicated that the width of the siding would replicate the existing siding and trim around windows, doors and corners. The work would not include the soffit and fascia. Mrs. Johnston-Glasmyer noted that the house was recently insulated with blown-in insulation and the locations where the insulation was blow-in can be seen from the street. Mr. Mike Schwartz, the contractor for the project was also present at the meeting.

Pat Ivory informed the Commission that when reviewing the application, the Commission should refer to the standards contained in the Landmarks Ordinance (Chapter 2.65) and the standards contained in the Randall Park Historic District Plan. The plan states relative to residing, œResiding with wood, masonite, aluminum, vinyl or steel is permitted only if the new siding imitates the width of the original siding within 1 or is no greater than 4 wide, and provided that all architectural details such as window trim, wood cornices, and ornaments either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance.

Pat noted that it appeared that the corner trim that was already installed was somewhat narrower than the original corner trim. Pat indicated that he looked at photos from the intensive survey, but could not determine the original width. Mr. Schwartz indicated that the corner trim was somewhat narrower.

The Commission discussed the application and questioned how the scalloped siding located in the gables would be addressed as well as the dentil detailing in the gables. Mr. Schwartz stated that the scalloped siding would be covered over, but matching the existing in design. The dentil molding detailing would be covered.

Pat Ivory indicated that the detailing of the dentils should be replicated or not covered.

Mr. Schwartz stated that he would prefer to cover the dentils, but that they would not be removed.

The Commission also noted that the decorative features around the windows in the gable ends of the house should not be removed as well as brackets and other decorative features.

ACTION TAKEN: Katrinka Bourne moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the siding, brackets, dentils shall not be removed, that the new siding installed over the scalloped gable end siding shall replicate and match the existing, architectural details around the windows and doors including the upper gable-end windows, should match the existing. The dentils can be covered, but not removed. Barbara Lozar seconded the motion. All votes were in favor. Motion carried.

2. Discussion and Recommendation of Zoning Ordinance Amendment for Damaged Landmark Properties.

The Commission reviewed the proposed amendment to the zoning ordinance that would address landmarked properties damaged by such occurrences as fire or weather. As noted at the previous meeting, State law does not allow for repairs exceeding 50% of the value for structures non-conforming by use. The amendment would allow repairs to landmark properties by conditional use permit that are damaged by fire, natural disaster, etc. that exceed this 50% threshold. The conditional use would be applicable to individual, contributing and pivotal properties, be applicable to all residential zoning districts, and would focus on repair versus complete replacement.

The Commission discussed the proposal and questioned whether reference to the 50% threshold should be included in the narrative and whether the word œsubstantially in Item #1 was too vague. Pat stated that previous Commission discussions recommended that the proposed ordinance allow for the Plan Commission and Landmarks Commission to interpret the level of repair on a case by case basis and allow for some interpretation regarding the level of repair that would be accepted.

ACTION TAKEN: Katrinka Bourne moved to support a zoning ordinance amendment as discussed with the suggestion that reference to the 50% threshold be included to clarify the intent of the amendment and that consideration be given to removing the term œsubstantially in item #1. Sue Nelson seconded the motion. All votes were in favor. Motion carried.

3. Update on Donald œSarge Boyd Plaque and Dedication

The Commission discussed the plaque dedication and unveiling for the Boyd plaque scheduled for June 17th, which will be in conjunction with the Municipal Band concert. Pat noted that he had received the necessary approvals for the Commission and Foundation to serve pie and ice cream as part of the event. The Commission indicated that they would like to do so as part of the event. Jenny Ebert, Barbara Lozar, Carrie Ronnander, Sue Nelson, and Katrinka Bourne volunteered to help.

4. Discussion and Direction on Third Ward Opted-out Properties

The Commission discussed the subcommittee meeting held on May 6th pertaining to the properties that opted out of the Third Ward Landmark Historic District. Pat provided an overview of the general recommendations of the subcommittee and the work they would like to undertake to inform both the property owners that opted out of the district, but also those that remained in the district. General recommendations include: determining the level of exterior changes made to the opted out properties since 1992, compiling information from studies relating to real estate values in historic districts, determine the number of rental and owner occupied opted out properties, developing a FAQ sheet addressing issues>

5. Update on Landmark Activities and Properties.

A. Update from Eau Claire Historic Preservation Foundation. Pat Kurtenbach provided an update from the Eau Claire Historic Preservation Foundation. He noted that the home tour was held on May 15th and was well attended. Six properties were featured. Pat also noted that the Foundation would assist in selling pie and ice cream at the plaque dedication and that they were working on the annual house hunt project.

B. Discussion of Lead Base Paint Regulations. The Commission discussed regulations recently enacted regarding contractor requirements pertaining to lead base paint in structures constructed prior to 1978. The Commission questioned whether these regulations may encourage the installation of more vinyl siding in lieu of painting existing wood siding. The Commission asked Pat to inquire with the Wisconsin Historical Society regarding the requirements.

C. Status of 404 Broadway Street. Mr. Ed Garlick, was present at the meeting to inform the Commission that he was interested in purchasing 404 Broadway Street (the former Bolton Refuge House) and requesting approval from the City to use the building as a 3-plex. No exterior alterations would be necessary. Mr. Garlick noted that the structure had been used as a 3-plex before the Bolton Refuge House occupied the building.

D. Update on 2009 CLG Grant Project. The Commission was informed that work is progressing on the 2009 CLG Grant project. The Intensive Survey and National Register nominations should be completed by Timothy Heggland by August.

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 5:45p.m.

Submitted by,

Sue Nelson, Secretary