

9/7/10 - Tuesday, September 7, 2010

**EAU CLAIRE
LANDMARKS COMMISSION**

Meeting of September 7, 2010

Members Present: Jenny Ebert, Katrinka Bourne, Sue Nelson, Carrie Ronnander, David Klinkhammer, Barbara Lozar

Members Absent: Ken Fulgione

Minutes. The minutes of the August 16, 2010 minutes were approved as written. (The Commission noted that Sue Nelson, the secretary for the Commission, was absent from the meeting and that staff drafted the minutes.)

The meeting was chaired by Jenny Ebert.

1. Consideration of Historic Residential Loan for 408 Lincoln Avenue.

Pat Ivory provided an overview of a Historic Residential loan application that was submitted by Rachel and Allen Keniston for shingling and misc. repairs to their house located at 408 Lincoln Avenue. The property is a contributing property in the Third Ward Historic Landmark District.

The work specifications include: re-roofing, insulation, finish carpentry, window repair, painting of the garage, ventilation, and misc. electrical and code items. Chris Bolstad, the Rehabilitation Specialist from the Housing Division, was present at the meeting to answer questions regarding the work specifications.

Pat indicated that staff had reviewed the financial information submitted for the application and completed the necessary verifications that are required. Based on this information, the Keniston™s have the necessary equity in their property to cover the maximum loan amount and have the ability to repay the maximum loan amount. Pat noted that the Keniston™s had not completed their review of the work specifications and some minor changes could still occur. He anticipated that the proposed work would cost less than the maximum allowed amount of \$17,500.

ACTION TAKEN: Sue Nelson moved to approve the Historic Residential loan for Rachel and Allen Keniston at 408 Lincoln Avenue for an amount not to exceed \$17,500. Katrinka Bourne seconded the motion. All votes were in favor. Motion carried.

2. Consideration of Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness.

A. Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 1500 State Street. Pat Ivory provided an overview of an application for Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by AHMC Management for 1500 State Street (Buffington House) to restore the front porch of the structure by removing the handicap ramp located on the front of the building and remove screens from the front porch. The Buffington House is a pivotal property within the Third Ward Historic Landmark District.

The handicap ramp was approved by the Commission and constructed in 2002. At that time, the ramp was a code requirement for the operation of the structure as a museum. The building is now being remodeled to be used as a four-plex and is no longer required by code. The new owners would like to remove the structure, which is not original to the building. The section of railing (approximately 3™) that was removed when the ramp was constructed would be rebuilt to match the existing railing.

The porch screening is not original. Removal of the screens and supporting framework would not result in any changes to the porch railings or columns. Katrinka Bourne questioned whether removal of the screens would prompt any code requirement that the porch railing height would have to be increased. The Commission suggested that the owner verify this prior to removal of the screens.

Brian Bessinger, representing AHMC, spoke in support of the application. Mr. Bessinger stated that the section of porch railing that was removed when the ramp was built will be constructed to match the existing porch railing.

ACTION TAKEN: Katrinka Bourne moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 1500 State Street contingent that the section of railing to be replaced, match the railing that was removed when the ramp was installed. David Klinkhammer seconded the motion. All votes were in favor. Motion carried.

B. Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 421 Hudson Street. Kathleen Johnson-Glasmyer has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows in the porch of her house located at 421 Hudson Street. The property is a contributing property within the Randall Park Historic Landmark District. Ms. Glasmyer had submitted an application to replace the porch windows that was to be reviewed by the Commission on July 12th, but the application was withdrawn after she changed her plans and indicated that she would be installing replacement double-hung windows with the style and size remaining the same as the existing windows.

Pat noted that the work had already been completed, and is different from that discussed at the Commission meeting. The work includes a sliding style window installed on the east side of the porch replacing the two middle original double-hung windows; and also one large double-hung window was installed on the west side of the porch, replacing two double-hung windows. Since this change in window style and size has occurred, which resulted in a structural change of the window openings, the Commission needs to review the change and either approve the change or require that double-hung windows of the original size be installed. Note that the windows on the front (north) elevation were replaced with windows of the same style and size.

Pat noted as stated back in July, that the Commission should refer to the standards contained in the Landmarks Ordinance (Chapter

2.65) and the standards contained in the Randall Park Historic District Plan in their review of this application.

Ms. Glasmyer was present at the meeting and spoke in support of the application. Ms. Glasmyer stated that the windows had been ordered by a previous contractor and couldn't be returned.

The Commission discussed the changes, possible options to make the windows resemble the appearance of the original windows that had been removed, and expressed concern that the work was already completed prior to Commission review. They also noted that they felt that the work was not consistent with the guidelines of the district plan and it could set a precedent if work not complying with the plan was approved.

ACTION TAKEN: Katrinka Bourne moved to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness noting that the replacement windows were not consistent with the landmark district guidelines and that the sliding style window installed on the east side of the porch must be replaced with two double hung style windows of similar size and dimension as the two double hung windows located to the right and left of the sliding style window. The overall appearance should resemble the original appearance with the four double hung windows as shown in the photograph included with the application. In addition, two double hung windows must be installed on the west side of the porch replacing the large window that was installed without approval. The two new double hung windows must be similar in size and dimension of the two original windows that were removed as shown in the photograph included with the application. David Klinkhammer seconded the motion. All votes were in favor. Motion carried.

3. Update on Landmark Activities and Properties.

A. Update from Eau Claire Historic Preservation Foundation. Pat Kurtenbach provided an update from the Eau Claire Historic Preservation Foundation. He stated that the Foundation was looking for properties for their recognition awards program. In addition, he also noted that the Wisconsin Historical Society will be sponsoring their fall conference in October, and that a traditional building conference was scheduled for October 20th in Chicago.

B. Update on 2009 CLG Grant Project. The Commission was informed that Tim Heggland was finalizing his work on the 2009 CLG Grant project. The work includes the intensive survey update and the preparation of two National Register nominations. A public meeting providing an overview of his report will be scheduled later this fall.

C. Third Ward Opted Out Properties. Pat Ivory indicated that the subcommittee needed to schedule a meeting. He stated that he had finished a draft of the FAQ document and wanted the subcommittee to discuss the information. Committee members indicated that they would arrange a meeting time.

D. WHS Fall Conference. Pat Ivory reminded Commission members about the fall conference sponsored by the Wisconsin Historical Society. Katrinka Bourne is planning on attending and representing the Commission.

E. CLG Annual Report. The Commission reviewed the CLG annual report which covered the 2009 calendar year.

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

Submitted by,

Sue Nelson, Secretary